

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION COMBINED CONSENSUS SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Project Number

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Chair

Essa Ahmed

	This ocoresticet becon	TICS I UDIIC IN	.00014				Loou Aiii	nica .	
PHASE 1 ST	TATEMENTS OF QUALIFICATIONS	Date:	6/9/2023					Number of Submitting Firms:	8
			PHAS	E 1 TOTAL WEIG	HTED SCORES	OF PANEL MEM	BERS		
	Firms	Essa Ahmed	Yelena Semenova	Nick Lutes	Charlene Wilson	Laura Maman	Financial Capacity	TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	RANK ORDER
		Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Pass/Fail		
1 FORMA	Construction + Mackenzie	79.50	76.95	82.05	100.00	73.90	Pass	412.40	3
2 BNBuild	ders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	78.10	89.45	77.00	99.50	69.55	Pass	413.60	2
3 Mortens	son + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	78.60	67.60	92.05	99.75	79.25	Pass	417.25	1
4 Howard	S. Wright + Integrus Architecture	73.75	78.90	80.00	74.20	65.45	Pass	372.30	5
5 Walsh 0	Construction + TCA Architecture	76.25	58.10	63.05	77.50	84.25	Pass	359.15	7
6 Lydig +	+ RossDrulisCusenbery + SHKS	75.75	79.80	81.00	99.25	71.90	Pass	407.70	4
7 Tiger C	onstruction + Zervas Architects	54.75	52.90	36.95	9.50	43.50	Pass	197.60	8
8 Absher	Construction + Bassetti Architects	72.75	72.75	79.05	67.00	69.35	Pass	360.90	6
9									
10									
11									
12									
13									
14	·								
15									
16									
17									
18									

SHORT LISTED FIRMS	Date:	7/21/2023				Number of Firms Interviewed:	3				
		PHASE ONE SCORES FOR SHORE LISTED FIRMS									
Firms	Essa Ahmed	Yelena Semenova	Nick Lutes	Charlene Wilson	Laura Maman	WEIGHTED SCORE					
1 Mortenson + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	78.60	67.60	92.05	99.75	79.25	417.25					
2 BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	78.10	89.45	77.00	99.50	69.55	413.60					
3 FORMA Construction + Mackenzie	79.50	76.95	82.05	100.00	73.90	412.40					
4											

FULL PROCUREMENT							
		TOTAL					
Firms	Essa Ahmed	Ahmed Yelena Nick Lutes		Charlene Wilson	Laura Maman	WEIGHTED SCORE	FINAL RANK ORDER
1 Mortenson + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	78.9	73.81	78.44	93.62	80.52	405.27	3
2 BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	81.1	92.42	82.73	98.40	88.61	443.23	1
3 FORMA Construction + Mackenzie	85.2	80.46	73.66	95.25	76.01	410.55	2
4							

SELECTION PANEL REACHED CONSENSUS:

Essa Ahmed

Senenor

Nicholas A. Lutes

Nick Lutes

Charler

C Buche

Laura Maman (Jul 27, 2023 07:20 PDT)

Laura Maman

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services
Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

6/9/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Essa Ahmed

CRITERIA	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WE I GHTED SCORE
Scores	Score	25	Score	20	Score	20	Score	15	Score	20	100
1 FORMA Construction + Mackenzie	85%	21.25	85%	17.00	75%	15.00	75%	11.25	75%	15.00	79.50
2 BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	70%	17.50	83%	16.60	80%	16.00	80%	12.00	80%	16.00	78.10
3 Mortenson + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	75%	18.75	83%	16.60	80%	16.00	75%	11.25	80%	16.00	78.60
4 Howard S. Wright + Integrus Architecture	70%	17.50	70%	14.00	75%	15.00	75%	11.25	80%	16.00	73.75
5 Walsh Construction + TCA Architecture	72%	18.00	80%	16.00	75%	15.00	75%	11.25	80%	16.00	76.25
6 Lydig + RossDrulisCusenbery + SHKS	70%	17.50	75%	15.00	80%	16.00	75%	11.25	80%	16.00	75.75
7 Tiger Construction + Zervas Architects	65%	16.25	70%	14.00	70%	14.00	70%	10.50	0%	0.00	54.75
8 Absher Construction + Bassetti Architects	70%	17.50	70%	14.00	75%	15.00	75%	11.25	75%	15.00	72.75
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											

COMMENTS:

Essa	Ahmed	
		-

6/9/2023

Essa Ahmed

Date

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services
Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

6/9/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Yelena Semenova

CRITERIA		Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience	
Scores	Score	25	Score	20	Score	20	Score	15	Score	20	100
1 FORMA Construction + Mackenzie	87%	21.75	83%	16.60	78%	15.60	60%	9.00	70%	14.00	76.95
2 BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	95%	23.75	94%	18.80	95%	19.00	66%	9.90	90%	18.00	89.45
3 Mortenson + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	65%	16.25	70%	14.00	65%	13.00	65%	9.75	73%	14.60	67.60
4 Howard S. Wright + Integrus Architecture	90%	22.50	85%	17.00	69%	13.80	68%	10.20	77%	15.40	78.90
5 Walsh Construction + TCA Architecture	61%	15.25	50%	10.00	61%	12.20	55%	8.25	62%	12.40	58.10
6 Lydig + RossDrulisCusenbery + SHKS	93%	23.25	60%	12.00	72%	14.40	81%	12.15	90%	18.00	79.80
7 Tiger Construction + Zervas Architects	50%	12.50	40%	8.00	62%	12.40	52%	7.80	61%	12.20	52.90
8 Absher Construction + Bassetti Architects	86%	21.50	65%	13.00	70%	14.00	75%	11.25	65%	13.00	72.75
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											
COMMENTS:	-										

Samenton

	6/9/2023
Yelena Semenova	Date



DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

6/9/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Nick Lutes

CRITERIA		Team Org	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Controls	DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE
			25	Score	20	Score	20	Score	15	Score	20	100
1	FORMA Construction + Mackenzie	84%	21.00	90%	18.00	80%	16.00	67%	10.05	85%	17.00	82.05
2	BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	72%	18.00	75%	15.00	75%	15.00	80%	12.00	85%	17.00	77.00
3	Mortenson + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	84%	21.00	100%	20.00	95%	19.00	87%	13.05	95%	19.00	92.05
4	Howard S. Wright + Integrus Architecture	80%	20.00	75%	15.00	75%	15.00	80%	12.00	90%	18.00	80.00
5	Walsh Construction + TCA Architecture	80%	20.00	50%	10.00	55%	11.00	67%	10.05	60%	12.00	63.05
6	Lydig + RossDrulisCusenbery + SHKS	84%	21.00	80%	16.00	80%	16.00	80%	12.00	80%	16.00	81.00
7	Tiger Construction + Zervas Architects	68%	17.00	25%	5.00	50%	10.00	33%	4.95	0%	0.00	36.95
8	Absher Construction + Bassetti Architects	72%	18.00	90%	18.00	85%	17.00	87%	13.05	65%	13.00	79.05
9												
10												
11												
12												
13												
14												
15												
16												
17												
18												
COI	MMENTS:	•					-		•	•		

 Nicholas A. Lutes
 6/9/2023

 Nick Lutes
 Date



This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

6/9/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Charlene Wilson

	CRITERIA	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE
		Score	25	Score	20	Score	20	Score	15	Score	20	100
1	FORMA Construction + Mackenzie	100%	25.00	100%	20.00	100%	20.00	100%	15.00	100%	20.00	100.00
2	BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	98%	24.50	100%	20.00	100%	20.00	100%	15.00	100%	20.00	99.50
3	Mortenson + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	99%	24.75	100%	20.00	100%	20.00	100%	15.00	100%	20.00	99.75
4	Howard S. Wright + Integrus Architecture	68%	17.00	70%	14.00	75%	15.00	80%	12.00	81%	16.20	74.20
5	Walsh Construction + TCA Architecture	50%	12.50	95%	19.00	95%	19.00	80%	12.00	75%	15.00	77.50
6	Lydig + RossDrulisCusenbery + SHKS	97%	24.25	100%	20.00	100%	20.00	100%	15.00	100%	20.00	99.25
7	Tiger Construction + Zervas Architects	10%	2.50	10%	2.00	10%	2.00	20%	3.00	0%	0.00	9.50
8	Absher Construction + Bassetti Architects	64%	16.00	50%	10.00	70%	14.00	80%	12.00	75%	15.00	67.00
9												
10												
11												
12												
13												
14												
15												
16												
17												
18												
COI	MENTS:	•						•		•	•	•

Pa		
	6/9/202	23
Charlene Wilson	 Date	



This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

6/9/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Laura Maman

	CRITERIA		Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience	
		Score	25	Score	20	Score	20	Score	15	Score	20	100
1	FORMA Construction + Mackenzie	70%	17.50	80%	16.00	75%	15.00	76%	11.40	70%	14.00	73.90
2	BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW Studios	75%	18.75	60%	12.00	75%	15.00	72%	10.80	65%	13.00	69.55
3	Mortenson + Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller	75%	18.75	85%	17.00	80%	16.00	70%	10.50	85%	17.00	79.25
4	Howard S. Wright + Integrus Architecture	65%	16.25	60%	12.00	65%	13.00	68%	10.20	70%	14.00	65.45
5	Walsh Construction + TCA Architecture	85%	21.25	90%	18.00	80%	16.00	80%	12.00	85%	17.00	84.25
6	Lydig + RossDrulisCusenbery + SHKS	70%	17.50	75%	15.00	70%	14.00	76%	11.40	70%	14.00	71.90
7	Tiger Construction + Zervas Architects	45%	11.25	45%	9.00	55%	11.00	55%	8.25	20%	4.00	43.50
8	Absher Construction + Bassetti Architects	65%	16.25	60%	12.00	70%	14.00	74%	11.10	80%	16.00	69.35
9												
10												
11												
12												
13												
14												
15												
16												
17												
18												
	ANACNITO.	•	•		-		•	•	•	•		

COMMENTS:

Laura Maman (Jul 27, 2023 07:20 PDT)

6/9/2023

Laura Maman

Date

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

7/21/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Essa Ahmed

	Mariabera	Mortenson + Mithun + Rice		BNBuilders + Miller Hull + MW		FORMA Construction +		
	Weighting	Fergus	Miller	Stu	dios	Mackenzie		
PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	
Overall Management Approach	25	80%	20.00	80%	20.00	90%	22.50	
Design Development and Management	25	80%	20.00	80%	20.00	80%	20.00	
GMP Development Plan	25	80%	20.00	85%	21.25	90%	22.50	
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	85%	17.00	85%	17.00	85%	17.00	
Safety	5	95%	4.75	90%	4.50	90%	4.50	
Acceptance of Contract and commitment to provide Bonding and Insurance	Pass/Fail	Pa	ass	Pass		Pass		
Diverse Business Inclusion Plan	Pass/Fail	Pa	ass	Pa	ISS	Pass		
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		81.75	75 82.75			86.50	
FULL PROCUREMENT								
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	78.60%	15.72	78.10%	15.62	79.50%	15.90	
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	20	80.00%	16.00	85.00%	17.00	90.00%	18.00	
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	35	81.75%	28.61	82.75%	28.96	86.50%	30.28	
4. INTERVIEW	20	80.00%	16.00	80.00%	16.00	80.00%	16.00	
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		76.33		77.58		80.18	
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	6.85	2.55	5.00	3.50	3.50	5.00	
Lowest Price Factor	3.50							
TOTAL SCORES	100		78.89		81.08		85.18	



Committee Member's Signature

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

7/21/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Yelena Semenova

		Morte	nson +	BNBuil	lders +	FORMA	
				Miller Hu	ıll + MW	Construction +	
	Weighting			Studios		Mackenzie	
PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Overall Management Approach	25	90%	22.50	85%	21.25	84%	21.00
Design Development and Management	25	82%	20.50	95%	23.75	88%	22.00
GMP Development Plan	25	90%	22.50	95%	23.75	87%	21.75
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	85%	17.00	90%	18.00	82%	16.40
Safety	5	95%	4.75	95%	4.75	95%	4.75
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		87.25		91.50		85.90
FULL PROCUREMENT							
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	67.60%	13.52	89.45%	17.89	76.95%	15.39
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	20	75.00%	15.00	95.00%	19.00	80.00%	16.00
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	35	87.25%	30.54	91.50%	32.03	85.90%	30.07
4. INTERVIEW	20	61.00%	12.20	100.00%	20.00	70.00%	14.00
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		71.26		88.92		75.46
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	6.85	2.55	5.00	3.50	3.50	5.00
Lowest Price Factor	3.50						
TOTAL SCORES	100		73.81		92.42		80.46

Senentry

Committee Member's Signature

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

7/21/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Nick Lutes

		Morter Mithun	nson + + Rice		lders + ıll + MW	FORMA Construction +	
	Weighting Fergus N					Mackenzie	
PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA		Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score
Overall Management Approach	25	75%	18.75	80%	20.00	75%	18.75
Design Development and Management	25	80%	20.00	75%	18.75	75%	18.75
GMP Development Plan	25	80%	20.00	80%	20.00	75%	18.75
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	80%	16.00	85%	17.00	75%	15.00
Safety	5	75%	3.75	75%	3.75	75%	3.75
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		78.50		79.50		75.00
FULL PROCUREMENT							
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	92.05%	18.41	77.00%	15.40	82.05%	16.41
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	20	75.00%	15.00	90.00%	18.00	65.00%	13.00
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	35	78.50%	27.48	79.50%	27.83	75.00%	26.25
4. INTERVIEW	20	75.00%	15.00	90.00%	18.00	65.00%	13.00
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		75.89		79.23		68.66
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	6.85	2.55	5.00	3.50	3.50	5.00
Lowest Price Factor	3.50						
TOTAL SCORES	100		78.44		82.73		73.66

Nicholas A. Lutes

Committee Member's Signature

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

7/21/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Charlene Wilson

			Mortenson + BNBuilders +			FORMA		
	Weighting	Mithun + Rice Fergus Miller		Miller Hull + MW Studios		Construction + Mackenzie		
PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA		Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	
Overall Management Approach	25	100%	25.00	100%	25.00	100%	25.00	
Design Development and Management	25	99%	24.75	100%	25.00	100%	25.00	
GMP Development Plan	25	100%	25.00	100%	25.00	100%	25.00	
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	100%	20.00	100%	20.00	95%	19.00	
Safety	5	100%	5.00	100%	5.00	100%	5.00	
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		99.75		100.00		99.00	
FULL PROCUREMENT								
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	99.75%	19.95	99.50%	19.90	100.00%	20.00	
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	20	96.00%	19.20	100.00%	20.00	98.00%	19.60	
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	35	99.75%	34.91	100.00%	35.00	99.00%	34.65	
4. INTERVIEW	20	85.00%	17.00	100.00%	20.00	80.00%	16.00	
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		91.06		94.90		90.25	
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	6.85	2.55	5.00	3.50	3.50	5.00	
Lowest Price Factor	3.50							
TOTAL SCORES	100		93.62		98.40		95.25	

Committee Member's Signature

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description

Bates Technical College - Fire Services Training Center

Date of Evaluation

Project Number

7/21/2023

2023-166

Name of Selection Panel Member

Laura Maman

		Morte	nson +	BNBui	lders +	FORMA		
		Mithun	+ Rice	Miller Hu	ıll + MW	Constru	ıction +	
	Weighting	Fergus	Miller	Stud	Studios		Mackenzie	
PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA		Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	
Overall Management Approach	25	90%	22.50	95%	23.75	85%	21.25	
Design Development and Management	25	90%	22.50	90%	22.50	80%	20.00	
GMP Development Plan	25	95%	23.75	95%	23.75	85%	21.25	
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	90%	18.00	85%	17.00	80%	16.00	
Safety	5	100%	5.00	100%	5.00	100%	5.00	
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		91.75		92.00		83.50	
FULL PROCUREMENT								
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	79.25%	15.85	69.55%	13.91	73.90%	14.78	
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	20	75.00%	15.00	95.00%	19.00	85.00%	17.00	
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	35	91.75%	32.11	92.00%	32.20	83.50%	29.23	
4. INTERVIEW	20	75.00%	15.00	100.00%	20.00	50.00%	10.00	
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		77.96		85.11		71.01	
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	6.85	2.55	5.00	3.50	3.50	5.00	
Lowest Price Factor	3.50							
TOTAL SCORES	100		80.52		88.61		76.01	



Laura Maman (Jul 27, 2023 07:20 PDT)

Committee Member's Signature

1	\cap	\cap	N	IN/	NΙΤ	rs.
м		. ,	IVI	IIV/	I VI	